Apple Role through Fair Labour Association (FLA) in Order to Fixing Foxconn’s Sweatshop in China

Sarah Puspa Sari
Magister Ilmu Hubungan Internasional, Universitas Katolik Parahyangan
E-mail: sarah_ps@unpar.ac.id

Abstract: In 2010 there is several news about suicides at Foxconn's factory in Shenzhen, China, a plant that assembles iPhones, iPods, and iPads for Apple. In order to fix this sweatshop practice in its chain, Apple make affiliates with independent labor monitoring organizations engaged by the Fair Labour Association (FLA) as participating company. In FLA charter stated that the member should adopted a “Workplace Code of Conduct”. The FLA Workplace Code of Conduct defines labor standards that aim to achieve decent and humane working conditions. FLA conducts independent assessments of a random sample of companies' supplier factories such as the three Foxconn facilities in Longhua, Guanlan and Chengdu to investigates the situation in Foxconn. Based on the assessment, FLA founded that the condition in Foxconn's factories, there is several violation on FLA Code Standard. FLA has made a series of recommendations to Apple and Foxconn, which is in immediate action required and sustainable remediation required. Thus, Apple released Supplier Responsibility Standards to make a standard for its own supply chain including Foxconn to meet several acquirements in order to prevent sweatshop's practice.

Keywords: Labour, Fair Labour Association, Suplier Responsibility Standards, Code of Conduct, Foxconn.

Abstrak: Pada tahun 2010 ada beberapa berita mengenai bunuh diri yang terjadi di pabrik Foxconn, Shenzhen, China, pabrik yang yang merakit iPhone, iPod dan iPad untuk Apple. Dalam rangka untuk memperbaiki praktek sweatshop ini dalam rantai produksinya, Apple membuat afiliasi dengan Fair Labour Association (FLA), organisasi independen dalam pemantauan tenaga kerja. Dalam piagamnya, FLA menyatakan bahwa seluruh anggota harus mengadopsi "Kode Etik Kerja". Kode etik kerja mendefinisikan standar perburuhan yang bertujuan untuk mencapai kondisi kerja yang layak dan manusiawi. FLA melakukan penilaian independen sampel acak dari pabrik pemasok perusahaan, seperti tiga fasilitas Foxconn di Longhua, Guanlan dan Chengdu untuk menyelidiki situasi di Foxconn. Berdasarkan penilaian, FLA menyatakan bahwa ada beberapa pelanggaran pada kode etik kerja di pabrik-pabrik Foxconn. FLA telah membuat serangkaian rekomendasi kepada Apple dan Foxconn, yang diperlukan tindakan segera dan perbaikan berkelanjutan. Dengan demikian, Apple merilis Supplier Responsibility Standards untuk membuat standar dalam rantai pasokan produksi termasuk Foxconn untuk memenuhi beberapa kriteria untuk mencegah praktek sweatshop ini.


Worldwide attention thus concentrated on Foxconn, a Taiwanese-owned international operation that assembles iPhones, iPods and iPads for Apple, and produces electronic components for Hewlett-Packard, 213 Dell, Sony, Nokia, and Nintendo. Activist scholars particularly those from the US and China, have linked the suicides with the global sweatshop issue. From their point of view, the deceased represent a group of Chinese migrant workers who travel from rural areas to coastal cities to work in Foxconn factories for better life. Nevertheless, most workers end up suffering minimal...

salaries and harsh working environments. At least 16 workers have taken their lives since the beginning of 2010 at Foxconn’s factory in Shenzhen, China, a plant that employs hundreds of thousands of workers. Another three have attempted to kill themselves at the job site. Most of the suicides have involved leaps from buildings, leading the company to promise to install "suicide nets" to discourage employees from jumping and announcing it would offer a 20 percent wage increase to some workers. Foxconn parent company, Hon Hai Precision Industries has been repeatedly accused of forcing employees to work long hours for low pay under stressful conditions. In order to fix this sweatshop practice in its chain, Apple make affiliates with independent labor monitoring organizations engaged by the Fair Labour Association (FLA) as participating company. Companies that have committed to FLA have to work with FLA to develop and improve social compliance systems that flag issues and lead to sustainable solutions when workers are at risk. Companies join the FLA on a voluntary basis, but they must meet strict labor standards for as long as they are affiliated. FLA holds Participating Companies accountable for monitoring 100% of their own supply chains to ensure that they meet FLA labor standards. In addition, FLA conducts independent assessments of a random sample of companies' supplier factories such as the three Foxconn facilities in Longhua, Guanlan and Chengdu to investigates the situation in Foxconn. This was action plan Apple and Foxconn created in response to the sweatshop accusation. Thus, through this paper the writer want to answer a research question about “How’s Apple’s role through FLA in fixing Foxconn’s Sweatshop in China?".

ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work

In order to understand sweatshop, first of all we must understand about principle in labor, which is root in ILO (International Labor Organization) Declaration that covers four fundamental principles and rights at work.

1.) Freedom of association and the effective recognition of the right to collective bargaining.

The freedoms to associate and to bargain collectively are fundamental rights. They

---


are rooted in the ILO Constitution and the Declaration of Philadelphia annexed to the ILO Constitution. Their core value has been reaffirmed by the international community, notably at the 1995 World Summit on Social Development in Copenhagen and in the 1998 ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work.\(^2^{18}\) The recognition of the right to collective bargaining is the key to the representation of collective interests. It builds on freedom of association and play an important role in enhancing enterprise performance, managing change and building harmonious industrial relations. Collective bargaining is a way of attaining beneficial and productive solutions to potentially conflictual relations between employers’ and workers’. Its potential as a powerful tool for engagement between employers’ and workers’ organizations to address economic and social concern. The right of workers and employers to establish their independent organizations is the basic prerequisite for collective bargaining and social dialogue. The right to strike has been recognized internationally as a fundamental right of workers and their organizations.

2.) Elimination of all forms of forced or compulsory labour.

Economic circumstances can drive people to give away their freedom, and labour exploitation can occur in many forms. But forced labour (to use a short comprehensive term) is something quite distinct. It occurs where work or service is exacted by the State or individuals who have the will and power to threaten workers with severe deprivations, such as withholding food or land or wages, physical violence or sexual abuse, restricting peoples' movements or locking them up. The ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work obliges member States to eliminate forced labour. A work relationship should be freely chosen and free from threats.\(^2^{19}\)

3.) Effective abolition of child labour.

Children should be given to enjoy the same human rights. But, lacking the knowledge, experience or physical development of adults and the power to defend their own interests in an adult world, children also have distinct rights to protection by virtue of their age. One of these is protection from economic exploitation and from work that is dangerous to the health and morals of children or which hampers the child's development.

4.) Elimination of discrimination in respect of employment and occupation.

Discrimination at work can occur in many forms.


different settings, from high-rise office buildings to rural villages, and in a variety of forms. It can affect men or women on the basis of their sex, or because their race or skin colour, national extraction or social origin, religion, or political opinions differ from those of others. Often countries decide to ban distinctions or exclusions and forbid discrimination on other grounds as well, such as disability, HIV status or age. Discrimination at work denies opportunities for individuals and robs societies of what those people can and could contribute. Discrimination in employment or occupation may be direct or indirect. Direct discrimination exists when laws, rules or practices explicitly cite a particular ground, such as sex, race, etc. to deny equal opportunities. Indirect discrimination occurs where rules or practices appear on the surface to be neutral but in practice lead to exclusions.

Fair Labour Association (FLA)

Apple responded this issue through the Fair Labor Association to conduct special voluntary audits of Apple’s final assembly suppliers, including Foxconn factories in Shenzhen and Chengdu, China, at Apple’s request. The Fair Labor Association (FLA) is a non-profit collaborative effort of universities, civil society organizations, and businesses. It describes its mission as promoting adherence to international and national labor laws. The FLA was established in 1999 and evolved out of a task force created by President Bill Clinton following a series of child labor and other sweatshop scandals involving major apparel and footwear brands.

In FLA charter stated that the member should adopted a “Workplace Code of Conduct”. The Code gives a guideline to several area such as Employment Relationship; Nondiscrimination; Harassment or Abuse; Forced Labor Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining; Health, Safety and Environment; Hours of Work; Compensation; which FLA believe to set standards that aim to achieve decent humane working conditions. The Code’s standards are based on international Labor Organization standards and internationally accepted good labor practices. The FLA provides a model of collaboration, accountability, and transparency and serves as a catalyst for positive change in workplace conditions. As an organization that promotes continuous improvement, the FLA strives to be a global leader in establishing best practices.


practices for respectful and ethical treatment of workers, and in promoting sustainable conditions through which workers earn fair wages in safe and healthy workplaces.

1. Employment Relationship
Employers shall adopt and adhere to rules and conditions of employment that respect workers and, at a minimum, safeguard their rights under national and international labor and social security laws and regulations.

2. Nondiscrimination
No person shall be subject to any discrimination in employment, including hiring, compensation, advancement, discipline, termination or retirement, on the basis of gender, race, religion, age, disability, sexual orientation, nationality, political opinion, social group or ethnic origin.

3. Harassment or Abuse
Every employee shall be treated with respect and dignity. No employee shall be subject to any physical, sexual psychological or verbal harassment or abuse.

4. Forced Labor
There shall be no use of forced labor, including prison labor, indentured labor, bonded labor or other forms of forced labor.

5. Child Labor
No person shall be employed under the age of 15 or under the age for completion of compulsory education, whichever is higher.

6. Freedom of Association and Collective Bargaining
Employers shall recognize and respect the right of employees to freedom of association and collective bargaining.

7. Health, Safety and Environment
Employers shall provide a safe and healthy workplace setting to prevent accidents and injury to health arising out of, linked with, or occurring in the course of work or as a result of the operation of employers’ facilities. Employers shall adopt responsible measures to mitigate negative impacts that the workplace has on the environment.

8. Hours of Work
Employers shall not require workers to work more than the regular and overtime hours allowed by the law of the country where the workers are employed. The regular work week shall not exceed 48 hours. Employers shall allow workers at least 24 consecutive hours of rest in every seven-day period. All overtime work shall be consensual. Employers shall not request overtime on a regular basis and shall compensate all overtime work at a premium rate. Other than in exceptional circumstances, the sum of
regular and overtime hours in a week shall not exceed 60 hours.

9. Compensation

Every worker has a right to compensation for a regular work week that is sufficient to meet the worker’s basic needs and provide some discretionary income. Employers shall pay at least the minimum wage or the appropriate prevailing wage, whichever is higher, comply with all legal requirements on wages, and provide any fringe benefits required by law or contract. Where compensation does not meet workers’ basic needs and provide some discretionary income, each employer shall work with the FLA to take appropriate actions that seek to progressively realize a level of compensation that does.

Foxconn as Multi National Corporation

Taiwanese-owned Foxconn is the world’s biggest electronics outsourcing manufacturer, operating 20 plants and employing more than 800,000 workers in China. The Shenzhen plant in Guangdong province houses 400,000 workers, making products from iPhones and iPads to PlayStations for international brands like Apple, Sony, Hewlett-Packard and Dell. Analysts estimate that about 70 percent of Apple’s products are manufactured there. Thought of primarily as an Apple supplier, Foxconn also builds products for Dell, HP, Microsoft, and other U.S. tech companies. Owned by Hon Hai Industries which uses the trade name Foxconn, the supplier has long been in the news over reportedly poor and restrictive factory conditions.

Today, Hon Hai / Foxconn Technology Group is the most dependable partner for joint-design, joint-development, manufacturing, assembly and after-sales services to global Computer, Communication and Consumer-electronic (”3C”) leaders. Aided by its legendary green manufacturing execution, uncompromising customer devotion and its award-winning proprietary business model, eCMMS, Hon Hai has been the most trusted name in contract manufacturing services (including CEM, EMS, ODM and CMMS) in the world.

Hon Hai / Foxconn’s Business Philosophy

Since 1974, Hon Hai / Foxconn had

---


always been guided by three Foxconnian visions; Through the most efficient "Total Cost Advantages" to make comfort of electronic products usage an attainable reality for all mankind; Through the proprietary one-stop shopping vertical integrated eCMMS model to revolutionize the conventional inefficient electronics outsourcing model; Through the devotion to greater social harmony and higher ethical standards to achieve a win-win model for all stakeholders including shareholders, employees, community and management.

Hon Hai / Foxconn business model that emphasizes on speed, quality, engineering services, flexibility and monetary cost saving. The most important thing is eCMMS that stands for e-enabled Components, Modules, Moves and Services. eCMMS is the vertical integrated one stop shopping business model by integrating mechanical, electrical and optical capabilities altogether. It covers solutions ranging from moulding, tooling, mechanical parts, components, modules, system assembly, design, manufacturing, maintenance, logistics, etc. Through the eCMMS model, Hon Hai / Foxconn's Southern China campus is not only the world's largest 3C manufacturing base, but also the shortest supply chain at the same time.

China Labor Watch Investigation on Foxconn's Sweatshop

Based on China Labor Watch’s press release on July 27, 2012, they found the following problems to be common in the ten factories:

1. Excessive Overtime: The average overtime in most of the factories was between 100 and 130 hours per month, and between 150 and 180 hours per month during peak production season, well above China's legal limits.

2. In most factories, workers generally work 11 hours every day, including weekends and holidays during peak seasons. Normally they can only take a day off every month, or in the peak season may go several months without a day off.

3. Low wages compel workers to accept long overtime hours. Most of the factories pay a basic salary equal to the minimum wage stipulated by the local law (around $200/month), so low that


About China Labor Watch: Founded in 2000, China Labor Watch is an independent not-for-profit organization. In the past ten years, CLW has collaborated with labor organizations and the media to conduct a series of in-depth assessments of factories in China that produce toys, bikes, shoes, furniture, clothing, and electronics for some of the largest companies. CLW's New York office creates reports from these investigations, educates the international community on supply chain labor issues, and pressures corporations to improve conditions for workers.
workers have to work long hours to support themselves.

4. Workers are exposed to a variety of dangerous working condition. Workers in all the factories reported safety concerns such as metal dust and hazardous working environments.

5. All too often, workers find the food offered in the factory cafeterias unsanitary. Their housing conditions are frequently overcrowded, dirty, and lacking in facilities.

6. Most workers are not familiar with unions and their function. They have little ability to push for reasonable working conditions.

7. Some factories do not pay for workers’ social insurance, work injury insurance, and other insurance required by law.

**Foxconn’s investigation by Fair Labour Association (FLA)**

FLA founded that the condition in Foxconn’s factories, there is several violation on FLA Code Standard, such as:

a. Working Hours

There are two issues here – the FLA Code Standard of 60 hours per week in total (regular plus overtime) and the Chinese legal limits of 40 hours per week and a maximum of 36 hours overtime per month (effectively nine hours per week). Foxconn factories exceeded both regulation above. This is confirmed by the worker survey that have been done by FLA. The survey indicated average weekly working hours of 56 hours, average maximum weekly working hours of 61 hours, and occasional long periods without a rest day; nearly half of the employees indicated that had been periods when they worked 11 or more consecutive days.

b. Health and Safety

There had been identified numerous issues related to inconsistent policies, procedures and practices. The investigation revealed that a considerable number of workers felt generally insecure regarding their health and safety. The issue of aluminum dust was of particular concern, as this was the cause of an explosion at the Chengdu facility last year. FLA found that, one year after the Chengdu explosion, Foxconn had improved operating procedures, measurement, and documentation to reduce risk related to aluminum dust where Apple products are made.

c. Industrial Relations and Worker
Investigators found that workers were largely alienated, in fact or in perception, from factories’ safety and health committees and had little confidence in the management of health and safety issues. The assessment also suggests that if workers had more involvement with developing and monitoring health and safety procedures, many of the problems with implementation could be avoided.

d. Compensation and Social Security Insurance

While Foxconn wages are above the Chinese average and the legal minimum, the assessment found that 14 percent of the workers may not receive fair compensation for unscheduled overtime. The assessors discovered that unscheduled overtime was only paid in 30-minute increments. This means, for example, that 29 minutes of overtime work results in no pay and 58 minutes results in only one unit of overtime pay. Across China, all workers must have health, accident, social security, unemployment, and maternity coverage, but the system is set up on a provincial and city basis. This means that workers who migrate from other cities or provinces can’t collect their insurance when they return home. Workers are further unmotivated to enroll because of a required co-pay into insurance programs from which they do not benefit.

FLA Recommended Actions & Remediation Plan

FLA has made a series of recommendations to Apple and Foxconn in two categories which is in immediate action required and sustainable remediation required. The recommendation was about hours of work, Foxconn has agreed to move beyond compliance with the FLA 60-hour/week standard to achieve full compliance with Chinese law regarding hours of work (limit of 36 hours of overtime per month) by July 1, 2013. This means reducing overtime hours from 80 per month to 36 while protecting worker pay. Foxconn will have to hire and train a significant number of extra workers, build accommodation for them, and develop a compensation package that addresses the income lost through reduced hours. Furthermore, there is another action about compensation, Foxconn has accepted that the policy and practice relating to unscheduled overtime and work-related meetings outside of regular working hours need to be changed. In the future, workers will be paid for overtime in units of 15 minutes and for work-related meetings outside regular hours will be compensated.

Another aspect was industrial rela-

ations, Foxconn has agreed to develop an action plan to align union activities with the provisions of the Shenzhen Municipal Implementing Regulations for the Trade Union Law, to enhance workers participation in committees and other union structures, to ensure that nominations and elections take place without management involvement and to engage committees in decision making processes. Workers will all receive a copy of the Collective Bargaining Agreement and new workers will receive information about the union and union activities during their orientation process.\textsuperscript{233}

The last thing was health, safety and environment. The key to improved performance in this area is to enhance workers’ engagement in the health and safety committees and to make those more active in the formulation and implementation of policies and procedures. The turnover of workers makes it necessary to refresh the training of workers frequently. We will continue to make periodic checks on the implementation and review of the standard operating procedures by Foxconn in order to ensure that the workers involved have the appropriate training and personal protective equipment, that the dust concentrations are measured at the appropriate times and remain within safe levels, and that the correct documentation is maintained.\textsuperscript{235}

Thus, Apple make a standard for its own supply chain including Foxconn to meet several acquirement in order to prevent sweatshop’s practice. Apple released Supplier Responsibility Standards more than 100 pages of comprehensive requirements our suppliers must follow to do business with Apple. Its also made a high-level Code of Conduct that showed the specific standards requirements our suppliers must follow in 20 key areas under labor and human rights, health and safety, environment, management systems, and ethics.\textsuperscript{236} Also expanded the standards by including requirements for student workers, ergonomic breaks, boundary noise, dormitory space and occupancy, emergency preparedness, responsible sourcing of minerals, environmental topics, and more.\textsuperscript{237}

\section*{Conclusions}

The FLA investigation reports depicting the Foxconn plants as inhumane sweatshops prompted Apple Inc. to hold its foreign contractors to higher standards.

\textsuperscript{235} Ibid., page 3.
\textsuperscript{236} Ibid., page 12-13.
FLA found that Foxconn had been violated several labour rights in its plant, such as working hours, health and safety, industrial relations and worker integration, compensation and social security insurance. The investigation reports have been released in order to fix Foxconn. Apple and Foxconn agreed in FLA investigations and remedial actions. The remedial actions that FLA recommended to Apple were reducing overtime hours from 80 per month to 36 while protecting worker pay, workers will be paid for overtime in units of 15 minutes and for work-related meetings outside regular hours will be compensated, enhance workers participation in committees and other union structures, to ensure that nominations and elections take place without management involvement and to engage committees in decision making processes, enhance workers’ engagement in the health and safety committees and to make those more active in the formulation and implementation of policies and procedures.

The investigations drive Apple to make a standard for its own supply chain including Foxconn to meet several acquirement in order to prevent sweatshop’s practice. Apple released Supplier Responsibility Standards more than 100 pages of comprehensive requirements our suppliers must follow to do business with Apple. Its also made a high-level Code of Conduct that showed the specific standards requirements our suppliers must follow in 20 key areas under labor and human rights, health and safety, environment, management systems, and ethics.

**Bibliography**


Dean, Jason, Suicides Spark Inquiries : Apple, H-P to Examine Asian Supplier After String of Deaths at Factory, The